

Zeitschrift: Asiatische Studien : Zeitschrift der Schweizerischen Asiengesellschaft = Études asiatiques : revue de la Société Suisse-Asie

Herausgeber: Schweizerische Asiengesellschaft

Band: 48 (1994)

Heft: 2: Proceedings of the Panel on Early Vaiesika , Hong Kong, August 1993

Artikel: The Vaiesikastra as referred to by Bhvaviveka in his Tarkajvl

Autor: Hattori, Masaaki

DOI: <https://doi.org/10.5169/seals-147104>

Nutzungsbedingungen

Die ETH-Bibliothek ist die Anbieterin der digitalisierten Zeitschriften. Sie besitzt keine Urheberrechte an den Zeitschriften und ist nicht verantwortlich für deren Inhalte. Die Rechte liegen in der Regel bei den Herausgebern beziehungsweise den externen Rechteinhabern. [Siehe Rechtliche Hinweise.](#)

Conditions d'utilisation

L'ETH Library est le fournisseur des revues numérisées. Elle ne détient aucun droit d'auteur sur les revues et n'est pas responsable de leur contenu. En règle générale, les droits sont détenus par les éditeurs ou les détenteurs de droits externes. [Voir Informations légales.](#)

Terms of use

The ETH Library is the provider of the digitised journals. It does not own any copyrights to the journals and is not responsible for their content. The rights usually lie with the publishers or the external rights holders. [See Legal notice.](#)

Download PDF: 15.03.2025

ETH-Bibliothek Zürich, E-Periodica, <https://www.e-periodica.ch>

THE *VAIŚEŚIKASŪTRA* AS REFERRED TO BY BHĀVAVIVEKA
IN HIS *TARKAJVĀLĀ*

Masaaki HATTORI, Kyoto

In the seventh chapter of his *Madhyamakahr̥daya-kārikā* (abbrev. *MH*), the author Bhāvaviveka makes a critical examination of the Vaiśeṣika doctrines. Unfortunately this chapter is missing in the Sanskrit manuscripts of *MH* which was in the hands of the late Professor V.V. Gokhale and is now kept by Professor S. Bahulkar. However, the Tibetan Bstan-'gyur furnishes us with *MH* and also Bhāvaviveka's auto-commentary on it, namely, the *Tarkajvālā* (*TJ*). In the introductory portion of the seventh chapter of *TJ*, a good number of sūtras are found quoted from a Vaiśeṣika source. The *Vaiśeṣika-sūtra* (*VS*) are handed down to us in three forms: (1) *VS*₁ with Candrānanda's *vṛtti*, (2) *VS*₂ with Vādīndra's *vyākhyā*, and (3) *VS*₃ with Śāṅkaramiśra's *Upaskāra*. The *sūtrapāṭhas* given in them differ from each other considerably. As will be shown below, the sūtras quoted in *TJ* are close to those given in *VS*₁. I will present below the Tibetan text of the introductory portion of *TJ*, Chapter VII, with the Sanskrit text of the quoted sūtras in footnotes.

Tibetan text

For this text I have collated the following two editions:

- D: sDe-dge edition, reprinted in the *Sde dge Tibetan Tripiṭaka*, *Bstan ḥgyur*, preserved at the Faculty of Letters, University of Tokyo, Dbu ma 3 (Dsa), Tokyo: Sekai Seiten Kankōkyōkai, 1977, pp. 121-122, fol. 242a.7-244a.6
- P: Peking edition, reprinted in the *Tibetan Tripiṭaka*, ed. D.T. Suzuki, Vol. 96 (Dbu-ma, Dsa), Tokyo-Kyoto 1957, pp. 111-112, fol. 272b.3-274b.6

The Sanskrit text of the sūtras in footnotes are given in accordance with the *sūtrapāṭhas* presented in:

- Vaiśeṣikasūtra of Kaṇāda, with the Commentary of Candrānanda*, ed. Muni Jambuvijayaji, Baroda: Oriental Institute, 1961 (GOS 136).

- P272b.3 // de nas da ni bye brag pa'i *de kho na ñid gtan la dbab pa la 'jug
D242b.1 pas rab tu byed pa bdun pa brtsam par bya'o // de la bye brag pas rañ
P4 gi grub pa'i mtha' ñid 'di lta mañ *du 'god par byed de / gshan dag la
brten nas goms pa las thar pa ni gcig ñid yin pas bdag cag gi⁽¹⁾ skyes bu
D2 ni byed pa med pa ma yin *te / ci shig yin she na / byed pa po dañ za
P5 ba po yin te / gañ gi phyir rtogs *pa la sogs pa yon tan las gshan pa'i
bdag ni yod de / de ni ma skyes pa / rtag pa / byed pa po / za ba po /
khyab pa / bya ba med pa'o // de bshin du sa dañ / chu dañ / me dañ /
D3 P6 rluñ rnam kyī rdul *phra rab de dag kyañ rtag pa ste / *grañs ji lta ba
bshin du yon tan bshi dañ / yon tan gsum dañ / yon tan gñis dañ / yon
tan gcig dañ ldan pa ni reg bya dañ / ro dañ / gzugs dañ / dri dañ
P7 D4 mtshuñs par ldan no // de dag ni mi reg par *rigs mthun pa la *ltos⁽²⁾ nas
rañ dañ mthun pa dañ / mthun pa ma yin pa'i bya ba rtsom par byed do /
/ phyogs dañ / nam mkha' dañ / dus kyañ ma skyes pa / khyad pa / rtag
P8 pa / bya ba med pa yin no // yid ni *rtag pa bya ba dañ bcas pa yoñs su
D5 chad pa'o // spyi dañ khyad par dañ 'du ba yañ ma *skyes pa / khyab pa /
rtag pa / cha med pa / bya ba med pa / rdzas dañ yon tan dañ / las la
P273a.1 brten pa yin no // yon tan *yañ kha cig ni rtag / kha cig ni mi rtag
pa'o // las ni mi rtag pa ñid yin no // de bshin du cha dañ cha can
D6 dañ / yon tan dañ yon tan can dañ / bya ba dañ*byed pa dañ / mtshan
P2 ñid dañ *mtshan ñid can dag ni gshan dañ gshan yin no // de bshin du
dbañ po dañ don dañ yid 'dus pa'i śes pa ni mñon sum gyi tshad ma'o //
gshan dag na re byed pa po ni yod bya ba ni med ces zer ro /
P3 / de *bshin du tshig gi don drug gis thams cad bsdus par rig par bya ste /
'di lta ste / rdzas dañ / yon tan dañ / las dañ / spyi dañ / khyad par
P4 dañ / 'du ba shes bya ba'o // de la rdzas shes bya ba'i *tshig gi don
rnam pa dgu ni 'di lta ste / sa dañ / chu dañ / me dañ / rluñ dañ /
D243a1 nam mkha' dañ / dus dañ / phyogs dañ / *bdag dañ / yid ces bya ba'i
P5 rdzas rnam so¹ // 'di lta ste / yon tan ñi śu *rtsa bshi ni yon tan gyi tshig
gi don yin la de ni 'di lta ste / gzugs dañ / ro dañ / dri dañ / reg bya dañ
/ grañs dañ / boñ tshod dañ, so so dañ / 'du ba dañ / 'bral ba dañ⁽³⁾ /
D2 P6 *gshan ñid dañ / gshan ma yin pa *ñid dañ / blo rnam dañ / bde ba
dañ / sdug bñal dañ / 'dod pa dañ / she sdañ dañ / 'bad pa shes bya ba
rnam ni yon tan no² // de bshin du las ni rnam pa lña

(1) P gis (2) P bltos (3) P om. 'bral ba dan

1 VS, 1.1.4: *prthivy āpas tejo vāyur ākāśam kālo dig ātmā mana iti dravyāni.*

2 Ibid., 1.1.5: *rūparasagandhasparśāḥ sañkhyāḥ parimāṇāni prthaktvaṃ samyogavibhāgau paratvāparatve buddhayaḥ sukhaduhkhe icchādveṣau prayatnaś ca guṇāḥ.*

THE *VAIŚEŚIKASŪTRA* AS REFERRED TO BY BHĀVAVIVEKA 701

- P7 ste / steñ du 'byin pa dañ / 'og tu *gnon pa dañ / bskum pa dañ /
D3 brkyañ ba dañ / +'gro ba shes bya ba'i las rnams so³ // de bshin du gañ
gi phyir rdzas dañ / yon tan dañ / las rnams la yod pa yin⁽⁴⁾ no // shes
P8 'byuñ ba'i rdzas dañ / *yon tan dañ / las rnams kyi don las gshan
shig yod pa de ni spyi shes bya bar brjod do⁴ // khyad shugs pa yod pa
D4 ni khyad par te⁽⁵⁾ / *ji ltar dkar po dañ / rnag po shes bya ba'i khyad
P273b.1 par ltar de bshin du rdzas *dañ yon tan shes bya ba'i khyad par yañ yin
no // yañ 'du ba ni ji ltar 'di la yod do shes yañ dag par blos rtogs⁽⁶⁾ par
'gyur ba'i don te⁵ / 'di dag ni tshig gi don drug yin no /
P2 D5 / de bshin du khyad par med pa dañ *ldan *pa'i rtag pa ni yod de rdzas
dañ ldan pa bya ba dañ byed pa dañ spyi dañ khyad par dañ ldan pa
shes bya ba ni rdzas da'n yon tan dañ las rnams kyi khyad par med
P3 pa'o⁶ // de bshin du rdzas kyis ni rdzas gshan rtsom par *byed la yon tan
D6 gyis kyañ yon tan gshan rtsom par byed do⁷ // yañ *las la ni spyi med
do⁸ // yañ rdzas ni byed pa por yañ mi 'gal la bya bar yañ mi 'gal lo⁹ //
P4 yon tan ni gñi ga'i'o⁽⁷⁾¹⁰ // rdzas kyi mtshan ñid *spyi ni bya ba dañ ldan
pa yon tan dañ ldan pa 'du ba'i rgyur gyur pa ste⁽⁸⁾ rdzas kyi mtshan ñid
D7 do¹¹ // rdzas la brten⁽⁹⁾ pa yon tan gshan dañ mi ldan pa 'du ba *dañ
P5 bral ba na yañ rgyu med pa ltos⁽¹⁰⁾ pa med pa ni yon tan gyi mtshan *ñid
do¹² // yañ las kyi mtshan ñid ni rdzas gcig pu yon tan med pa 'du ba
dañ 'bral ba na yañ ltos⁽¹⁰⁾ pa med pa'i byed pa po ni las kyi mtshan ñid
P6 do¹³ // de bshin du rdzas ni spyi'i byed pa po'o¹⁴ // de bshin du yon *tan

(4) D ma yin (5) P ste (6) P rtog (7) P ga'i (8) P te (9) P rten
(10) P blto

- 3 *Ibid.*, 1.1.6: *utkṣepaṇam avakṣepaṇam ākuñcanaṃ prasāraṇam gamanam iti karmāṇi.*
4 Cf. *ibid.*, 1.2.7-8: *sad iti yato dravyaguṇakarmasu. dravyaguṇakarmabhyo 'rthāntaraṃ sattā.*
5 Cf. *ibid.*, 7.2.29: *iheti yataḥ kāryakāraṇayoh sa samavāyah.*
6 *Ibid.*, 1.1.7: *sad anityaṃ dravyavat kāryaṃ kāraṇaṃ sāmānyaviśeṣavad iti dravya-
guṇakarmanām aviśeṣah.*
7 *Ibid.*, 1.1.8-9: *dravyāṇi dravyāntaram ārabhante. guṇās ca guṇāntaram.*
8 Cf. *ibid.*, 1.1.10: *karma karmasādhyam na vidyate.*
9 *Ibid.*, 1.1.11: *kāryāvirodhi dravyaṃ kāraṇāvirodhi ca.*
10 *Ibid.*, 1.1.12: *ubhayathā guṇāh.*
11 *Ibid.*, 1.1.14: *kriyāvad guṇavat samavāyikāraṇam iti dravyalakṣaṇam.*
12 *Ibid.*, 1.1.15: *dravyāśrayī aguṇavān saṃyogavibhāgeṣv akāraṇam anapekṣa iti guṇa-
lakṣaṇam.*
13 *Ibid.*, 1.1.16: *ekadravyam aguṇaṃ saṃyogavibhāgeṣv anapekṣaṃ kāraṇam iti karma-
lakṣaṇam.*
14 *Ibid.*, 1.1.17: *(dravyaguṇakarmanām) dravyaṃ kāraṇaṃ sāmānyam.*

- D243b.1 *ni 'du ba dañ +bra⁽¹¹⁾ ba'i byed pa por 'jug pa'o¹⁵ // rdzas rnams ni rdzas kyi bya ba ste¹⁶ / ji ltar sor mo gñis bshin no // yon tan las yon tan 'byuñ ste / ji ltar gzugs las gzugs bshin no¹⁷ /*
- P7 / *de bshin du rdzas so so'i mtshan ñid brjod par bya ste / gzugs dañ /
- D2 *ro dañ / dri dañ / reg bya dañ ldan +pa ni sa'i rdzas so¹⁸ // gzugs dañ / ro dañ / reg bya dañ ldan pa ni⁽¹²⁾ chu ste / gser ba dañ rlan⁽¹³⁾ pa*
- P8 **ñid do¹⁹ // me ni gzugs dañ / reg bya dañ ldan pa'o²⁰ // rluñ ni reg pa dañ ldan pa ste²¹ / rtags mi mthoñ ba'o²² // nam mkha'⁽¹⁴⁾ ni yon tan*
- D3 *sgra dañ ldan pa'o // gshan dañ gshan ma yin pa'dañ / lhan⁽¹⁵⁾ cig dañ*
- P274a.1 *lhan *cig ma yin pa dañ / dus riñ ba dañ thuñ ba shes bya ba ni dus kyi rtags so²³ // gañ 'di dañ 'di shes bya ba de ni phyogs kyi rtags te²⁴ / snar ñi ma dañ ldan par gyur pa dañ / phyis ldan par 'gyur ba las*
- P2 D4 **sar dañ / de bshin du lho dañ / nub dañ / byañ shes *bya bas²⁵ phyogs kyi khyad par bstan pa yin no // dbañ po dañ don dañ / lhan cig gnas pa ni bdag yin no // ses pa'i ño bo⁽¹⁶⁾ med pa dañ ño bo yod pa ni yid*
- P3 **kyi rtags so²⁶ /*
- / gshan yañ 'dir thar pa 'dod pa dag bla ma dañ ñe bar soñ nas phyi
- D5 *dañ nañ dag la phun sum tshogs par +bya ste / khrus dañ dbañ bskur ba dañ / smyuñ⁽¹⁷⁾ bar gnas pa dañ / tshañs par spyod pas bla ma'i khyim*
- P4 *du gnas pa dañ / nags su gnas pa dañ / mchod sbyin dañ / sbyin pa la phyogs pa dañ / rgyu skar dañ / dus ñes pa la mthoñ bar spyod par*
- D6 *byed pa'i mi mthoñ ba ni chos shes brjod la²⁷ / +de'i don du sten par*

(11) P 'bra
(15) P ltan

(12) P pa'i
(16) P ño bo ñid

(13) P ldan
(17) P bsñun

(14) P mkha'i

15 Cf. *ibid.* 1.1.18-19: *tathā guṇaḥ saṃyogavibhāgānām karma.*

16 *Ibid.*, 1.1.22: *dravyāṇām dravyaṃ kāryaṃ (sāmānyam).*

17 Cf. *ibid.*, 1.1.26: *rūpāṇām rūpam.*

18 *Ibid.*, 2.1.1: *rūparasagandhasparśavatī pṛthivī.*

19 *Ibid.*, 2.1.2: *rūparasasparśavatya āpo dravāḥ snigdhās ca.*

20 *Ibid.*, 2.1.3: *tejo rūpasparśavat.*

21 *Ibid.*, 2.1.4: *vāyuh sparsāvān.*

22 Cf. *ibid.*, 2.1.10: *(na ca dṛṣṭānām sparsā ity) adṛṣṭalingo vāyuh.*

23 *Ibid.*, 2.2.6: *aparaṣmin paraṃ yugapad ayugapac ciraṃ kṣipram iti kālalingāni.*

24 *Ibid.*, 2.2.12: *ita idam iti yatas tad diśo liṅgam.*

25 *Ibid.*, 2.2.16-17: *ādityasaṃyogād bhūtapūrvād bhaviṣyato bhūtāc ca prācī. tathā dakṣiṇā prācīc udīcī ca.*

26 Cf. *ibid.*, 3.2.1: *ātmendriyārthasannikarṣe jñānasyābhāvo bhāvaś ca manaso liṅgam.*

27 Cf. *ibid.*, 6.2.2: *abhiṣecanopavāsabrahmacaryagurukulavāsavānaprasthyayajñadāna-prokṣaṇadinnakṣatramantrakālaniyamās cādṛṣṭāya.*

THE *VAIŚEŚIKASŪTRA* AS REFERRED TO BY BHĀVAVIVEKA 703

- P5 byed pa la yañ chos *shes bya'o // de las bzlog pa ni chos ma yin pa shes bya ste / de lta bu'i chos dañ chos ma yin pa'i mtshan ñid la 'jug pa las bde ba dañ sdug bsñal yin la / de dag la chags pa dañ sdañ pa'o /
- P6 D7 / des byas pas 'di *ltar yañ skye shiñ 'khor 'bar 'gyur te / 'di ltar chos dañ chos ma yin pa la 'jug pa'i mtshan ñid kyis thogs ma med pa'i dus nas bciñs shes brjod do /
- P7 / ji ltar 'khor ba thog ma med pa de bshin du ci tha ma yañ med *pa'i bdag ñid gcig yin nam she na / de ni ma yin te / thar pa yod pa ste /
- D244a.1 de kho na ñid *śes pa las tha ma thar par 'gyur ro // yañ de ni gañ chos dañ chos ma yin pa dag spyad pas yañ dañ yañ 'khor shiñ 'khor ba zo
- P8 *chun rgyud⁽¹⁸⁾ mo'i 'khrul 'khor gyi gnas lta bu'i 'khor bar 'jug par 'gyur la / de med pas yañ 'byuñ ba ñid mtshams 'sbyor ba yañ med pa'i phyir thar pa yin te / mar me śi bar gyur pa'i snañ ba bshin no /
- P274b.1 / lus dañ *bcas pa'i bdag yid dañ ldan par gyur pa ni 'tsho ba yin la / de'i ma mthoñ ba mi 'byuñ bas med par gyur pa ni kun tu sbyor ba
- D3 med pa ste / yañ 'byuñ bar mi 'gyur ba'i phyir dañ po'i lus 'la sogs pa
- P2 gtan mi 'byuñ *bar 'gyur ro /
- / gal te chos dañ chos ma yin pa med par ji ltar 'gyur she na / ma 'oñs pa mi 'byuñ shiñ bsags pa 'gog pa ste / de la lus dañ / dbañ po dañ /
- P3 yid las tha dad pa'i bdag mthoñ ba na dge ba skye bar *mi 'gyur la /
- D4 de sgrub par *byed pa yoñs su spañs pas ma 'oñs pa yañ mi skye ba ste⁽¹⁹⁾ / bsags pa 'gog pa yañ lus kyid de kho na ñid la rtogs⁽²⁰⁾ par byed
- P4 pa na chags par mi rtsom pa'o /
- / don dam pa'i bdag ñes *par rtogs śiñ tshig gi don drug gi de kho na ñid ñes par śes pa na / chos kyañ med par +'gyur ba yin te / 'dir lus
- D5 dañ yid kyid rnam rtog ni // thams cad spañs nas dri med pa'i // yoñs
- P5 su 'da' bar de 'gro *ste // śiñ zad pa yi me bshin no // shes dam la bstan pa yin no // ji ltar khyab pa'i bdag ni byed pa med pa yin du zin
- D6 kyañ / 'on kyañ yid kyis⁽²¹⁾ 'bdag ces 'dzin par byed pas yid dañ kun tu
- P6 sbyor ba med *pa ni yañ 'byuñ bar mi 'gyur ro shes ñe bar 'dogs so // shes bya ba 'di lta bu ni bye brag pa'i grub pa'i mtha' yin no //

(18) D brgyud

(19) P ba'o

(20) P rtog

(21) P kyid

Remarks on the quotation of sūtras

In D243a.3/P273a.8, the term 'spyi' (= *sāmānya*) is used instead of 'yod pa ñid' (= *sattā*). This point is discussed in Tachikawa's paper in the present volume.

In D243a.6/P273b.7 the text runs: *las la ni spyi med do* (There is no *sāmānya* in *karman*). This does not make sense. The term °*sādhyam* in *VS* 1.1.10 is mistaken for °*sāmānyam* in the manuscript used for translation or by the translator.

Following the citation of *VS*, 1.1.17 (D243a.7/P273b.5), which states that a *dravya* is a cause common to *dravya*, *guṇa* and *karman*, the Tibetan text states that a *guṇa* is a cause of *saṃyoga* and *vibhāga*. As a matter of fact this is wrong. The sūtra 1.1.18 (*tathā guṇaḥ*) and 1.1.19 (*saṃyoga-vibhāgānām [kāraṇam] karma*) are confused.

It has been mentioned above that the *sūtrapāṭhas* of the quotation in *TJ* is close to those found in *VS*₁. D243a.6/P273b.3: *rdzas ni ... mi 'gal lo* exactly coincide with the reading given in *VS*₁: *kāryāvirodhi dravyam kāraṇāvirodhi ca*, and not with *VS*₃: *na dravyam kāryam kāraṇam ca bādhati* (1.1.12).

In D243b.2-3/P273b.8-274a.1, *VS*, 2.2.6 which gives a definition of *kāla* is quoted. Both *VS*₂ and *VS*₃ present a different reading: *aparasminn aparam ... iti kālalingam*. The phrase 'aparasminn param' means the reversal of the concepts of 'para' and 'apara'. We form the concept of 'para' (remote) in regard to an old person who is standing at a near place (*apara*), and that of 'apara' (near) in regard to a young person who is standing at a distance (*para*). This reversal of the concepts is due to time. The phrase 'aparasminn aparam' does not make sense.

The first one of the two sentences in D243b.4/P274a.2-3: 'dban po dan ... rtags so' may be translated as: 'The *ātman* is that which is together with sense-organ and object.' This looks like a definition of *ātman*, because this sentence immediately follows the sūtras giving the definition of time and space. However, no such definition of *ātman* is to be found in *VS*. The latter sentence exactly corresponds to the latter half of *VS*, 3.2.1: *jñānasyābhāvo bhāvaś ca manaso lingam*. Thus it may be right to conjecture that the first half of this sūtra: *ātmendriyārthasaṃnikarṣe* was wrongly translated or corrupted in the manuscript used.

Before citing many sūtras, Bhāvaviveka makes reference to the Vaiśeṣika concept of *ātman*, according to which, the *ātman* is not *akarṭṛ* as maintained by the Sāṃkhya, but it is *karṭṛ* and *bhokṭṛ*; it is different from

THE *VAIŚEŚIKASŪTRA* AS REFERRED TO BY BHĀVAVIVEKA 705

attributes such as *buddhi* and so on, and is unborn (*ajāta*), eternal (*nitya*) all-pervading (*vibhu*) and devoid of activity (*niṣkriya*). He shows much interest in the Vaiśeṣika view on liberation (*mokṣa*) and gives a detailed explanation of it in D243b.4-244a.6/P274a.3-274b.6, which is translated below.²⁸

The Vaiśeṣika view on liberation (Translation)

Furthermore, here [in this Vaiśeṣika system, it is taught that] those who desire to attain liberation should approach a teacher (*guru*) and accomplish perfection internally and externally. The unseen force (*adṛṣṭa*) produced by practicing ablution (*snāna*), initiation (*abhiṣecana*), fast (*upavāsa*), residence in the house of a teacher (*gurukulavāsa*) as a student of the Veda, residence in a forest (*vānaprasthya*), sacrifice (*yajña*), giving (*dāna*), observance of the restrictions concerning direction (*diś*), constellation (*nakṣatra*) and time (*kāla*) is called '*dharma*' (merit), and the practice for the purpose [of producing *dharma*] is also called *dharma*. That which is reverse of it is called '*adharma*' (demerit). By acting for what are characterized thus as *dharma* and *adharma*, there arise pleasure (*sukha*) and pain (*duḥkha*), and attachment [to the former] and aversion [from the latter]. Being affected by these [attachment and aversion], man is born again [in another world] as in this world and undergoes transmigration. Thus it is said that man has been kept in bondage from the beginningless time by what are characterized as actions for *dharma* and *adharma*.

It might be asked: Just as the transmigration is beginningless, even so it, being of one and the same nature, is endless, isn't it? This is not right. There is the liberation [from transmigration]. By apprehending the true nature [of *padārthas*], man finally attains liberation. (D244a.1-3/P274a.7-b.2 is omitted)

If it is asked how *dharma* and *adharma* become extinct, [we answer that] the future [*dharma* and *adharma*] will not arise and those which have been accumulated are discarded. When the soul (*ātman*), which is different from body (*śarīra*), sense-organs (*indriya*) and mind (*manas*) is perceived, pleasure [or pain, which causes attachment or aversion] does not arise, and

28 *TJ*, Chap. VII was translated into Japanese by Y. Miyasaka in his "*Ronri no Honoo ni okeru Vaisheshika Tetsugaku*," *Koyasan Daigaku Ronshū*, Vol. 1 (1958), pp. 51-87. This translation (?) is quite unintelligible to me, and I could not derive any help from it for my understanding of the text.

by the complete abandonment of the causes (*sādhana*), the future [*dharma* and *adharma*] also will not ensue. The accumulated [*dharma* and *adharma*] are also discarded. On apprehending the true nature of the body, man will not begin to form attachment to it.

When man definitely apprehends the real soul and firmly understands the true nature of the six *padārthas*, *dharma* [and *adharma*] also become extinct. On this point it is affirmatively²⁹ stated as follows: "By completely abandoning the body and the false notions formed by the mind, one attains the pure, perfect deliverance. [This state is] just like the fire of which the fuel is burnt out." Although the all-pervading soul is devoid of action, man recognizes the mind as the soul³⁰ [and attributes the action of the mind to the soul]. Therefore, when there is no conjunction [of the soul]³¹ with the mind, it is figuratively stated that [the soul] has become free from re-birth, [attributing to the soul the actions of departing from the body and entering into the womb, which actually belong to the mind].

It is to be noted that in this passage we find some ideas which are very close to those expressed by Praśastapāda in his *Padārthadharmasamgraha* (*PDhS*). The idea that the apprehension of the six *padārthas* will lead man to liberation is noticed in *PDhS*³², but it could be ascribed to a pre-Praśastapāda Vaiśeṣika, since a similar idea is already propounded in the *Nyāyasūtra*, 1.1.1: *pramāṇaprameya° ... °nigrahassthānānām tattvajñānān niḥśreya-sādhigamaḥ*. However, that the state of perfect deliverance is described in *TJ* with the expression 'just like the fire of which the fuel is burnt out' (*śin zad pa yi me bshin no = dagdhendanānalavat*), which is found in Praśastapāda's description of the state of liberation³³, seems to show that Bhāvaviveka was familiar with Praśastapāda's work. If that were the case, Praśastapāda must have lived prior to Bhāvaviveka, to whom the dates 510-570 A.D. are assigned.³⁴ Taking into account that he was under the influence of Dignāga (480-540 A.D.), I would assign Praśastapāda the dates 500-560 A.D.

29 *Lit.*, under oath (*dam la*).

30 Tib., *yiḍ kyis bdag ces 'dzin par byed pas*. I have conjectured that '*mana ātmeti grahaṇāt*' was wrongly taken to read '*manasātmeti ...*'

31 Or, *aśītapītasamyoga* and *kāryāntarasamyoga* mentioned in *VS*, 5.2.19.

32 Vizianagram Skt. Ser., 4, 1895 (Reprint: Sri Garib Dass Oriental Ser., 13, Delhi 1984), pp. 281-282.

33 *PDhS*, p. 282.4.

34 Cf. Kajiyama, Y., "Bhavaviveka, Sthiramati and Dharmapala," *Beiträge zur Geistesgeschichte Indiens*; Festschrift für E. Frauwallner (*WZKSO*, XII-XIII), Wien 1968, pp. 193-203.